Planet Alsioff: A problem set for students of phase equilibria or metamorphic petrology

DONALD M. BURT

Department of Geology, Arizona State University, Tempe, Arizona 85287-1404, U.S.A., and Lunar and Planetary Institute, 3303 NASA Road 1, Houston, Texas 77058-4399, U.S.A.

This contribution might more appropriately appear in a publication such as Journal of Geological Education. Nevertheless, it has been brought to my attention that this part of the geological literature is not routinely followed by most readers of American Mineralogist. For this reason and others, I felt that many of our readers would find this deviation from our normal articles useful or entertaining.

You are given incomplete data about a hypothetical planet Alsioff where SiF₄ is the major volatile and Al, Si, O, and F are the only elements present. You then are challenged to answer a series of questions that involve qualitatively working out the metamorphic and metaso-matic phase equilibria on such a planet. Thermodynamic data are not required; all that is needed to answer the questions are a paper and pencil. (In fact, thermodynamic calculations yield answers that are inconsistent with the problems; see section entitled “Disclaimer” following the problems). An internally consistent set of answers will be presented in the next issue (Burt, 1988).

INTRODUCTION

You are given incomplete data about a hypothetical planet Alsioff where SiF₄ is the major volatile and Al, Si, O, and F are the only elements present. You then are challenged to answer a series of questions that involve qualitatively working out the metamorphic and metaso-matic phase equilibria on such a planet. Thermodynamic data are not required; all that is needed to answer the questions are a paper and pencil. (In fact, thermodynamic calculations yield answers that are inconsistent with the problems; see section entitled “Disclaimer” following the problems). An internally consistent set of answers will be presented in the next issue (Burt, 1988).

DATA

The C.I.A. has recently intercepted a report allegedly originating with the Sobriskian Academy of Sciences. The report, which is somewhat garbled, states that survivors of the first Sobriskian Interstellar Space Expedition (SISE) recently returned to Earth from the planet Alsioff, bearing the body of their captain, Ivigtut Greisenovich Alsioff (for whom the planet was named).

The planet, for which even the general location is not given, is reported to have a remarkable geochemistry, in that its surface consists solely of the elements Al, Si, O, and F. The surface is very hot, and the atmosphere consists predominantly of gaseous SiF₄ in equilibrium with minor O₂. Precipitation, classified as “snow” by the Sobriskians, occurs in the form of doubly terminated and complexly twinned quartz crystals of incredible beauty and variety. Violent surface “quartz storms” are the major erosional elements on the planet. In fact, some members of the first expedition perished during such a storm, when the sharp points of quartz crystals penetrated their space suits. The victims (including the captain) were immediately petrified and, except for the captain, were left on the planet as their own agate gravestones. (The captain’s shrunken and agatized remains have been placed in an upright position near the front entrance of SISE headquarters in the Sobriskian capital city of Ivresia. Tours are contemplated.)

The crystalline basement rocks, metamorphic and igneous, are largely bimineralic assemblages involving quartz, kyanite, andalusite, sillimanite, topaz, corundum, and a new mineral, crystalline AlF₃, named “alfite” by the Sobriskian scientists. (Properties: Transparent, greasy luster, hardness 3, sp. gr. 3.20, rhombohedral, space group R32, no cleavage.)

The planet is tectonically active and as rocks from the interior become exposed at the surface, sediments form by physical and chemical weathering; these then are buried and undergo progressive metamorphism. Progressive metamorphism on Alsioff mainly involves devolatilization of fluid SiF₄.

Sediments consist largely of windblown deposits of quartz and “alfite.” Nearly monomineralic sedimentary rocks are common and consist of coarse-grained quartzites and fine-grained phyllitic “alfitites,” but sedimentary rocks of intermediate bulk composition also occur.

Intrusive rocks, consisting mainly of “alfite” with accessory corundum, occur as both intrusive and extrusive bodies.

Fluid inclusions in metamorphic quartz crystals consist mainly of gaseous SiF₄, commonly with daughter crystals of “alfite.” Topaz does not contain fluid inclusions but instead contains solid inclusions consisting of intergrown quartz and “alfite.”

PROBLEMS

1. What chemical reaction should affect water exposed to the atmosphere of Alsioff? (The same thing should happen to water in the human body and did destroy and preserve the agatized members of the first expedition.)

2. What can you say about controls on the O₂ and F₂ contents of the Alsioffian atmosphere? What about their

---

1 See Section entitled “Disclaimer.”
relative abundances? (Hint: write the buffer reaction involved and the form of its equilibrium constant.)

3. Consider the phases in Table 1 and plot their compositions on a suitable planar polyhedron (triangle or “reciprocal ternary” rectangle).

4. On the polyhedron above, draw tie lines that indicate the probable phase compatibilities at low temperatures and relatively high pressures of SiF₄. Assume that corundum never occurs with quartz nor aluminosilicate with “albite.”

5. Deduce the probable sequence of devolatilization reactions involving SiF₄ with progressive thermal metamorphism. Write the four reactions in order of increasing temperature. (Note: during progressive thermal metamorphism on Alsioff, corundum appears at lower grades than an aluminosilicate phase.)

6. Where sillimanite is the first aluminosilicate phase to appear during progressive metamorphism, quartz is always absent. In quartz-bearing rocks, the first aluminosilicate phase to appear is either kyanite or andalusite, never sillimanite. Using this information, draw a schematic P-T diagram of metamorphic facies on Alsioff, showing the devolatilization reactions in addition to the stability fields of the Al₄SiO₄ polymorphs. Assume that the devolatilization reactions form curves that are concave upward, with gradually increasing slopes (similar to devolatilization reactions on Earth).

7. At high temperatures, AlF₃ becomes somewhat volatile, and an appreciable amount of it dissolves in the SiF₄ metamorphic fluid (indicated by the AlF₃ daughter crystals found in these inclusions, as mentioned under “Data”). At an arbitrary pressure, and neglecting the possible solubility of other condensed phases in the SiF₄-AlF₃ metamorphic fluid, draw a schematic T-X diagram that shows the condensed phases in equilibrium with the fluid. Explain, if you can, the solid inclusions of “albite” and quartz in topaz, also mentioned under “Data.”

8. Describe in detail the outcrop-scale changes (with respect to both mineralogy and physical appearance) that one might expect to see developed during progressive thermal metamorphism of thick beds consisting of pure “albite” (possibly the result of a volcanic pyroclastic eruption or lava flow), alternating with thick beds of pure quartz (possibly the result of a heavy fall of quartz “snow”).

9. Limited sampling of crystalline basement rocks was carried out at the Sobriskian landing site during a lull between “quartz storms.” The locations of these samples, together with the observed mineral assemblages, are plotted on the accompanying map (Fig. 1), along with several easily recognizable geologic contacts. Use the mineral-
assemblage data and the results of question 6 above to
draw appropriate metamorphic isograds on the map.

10. Which two-phase assemblage indicates the highest
metamorphic pressures that can be specified on Alsioff?
Circle the area of the map where it occurs.

**Disclaimer**

This problem set is based solely on deriving topologic
and reaction relations (note that I have deliberately
avoided specifying temperatures and pressures for the
planet); it is not claimed that the problems or derived
results are thermodynamically reasonable or even possi-
ble, particularly as regards topaz, which is much more
stable than indicated. The rationale for this approach will
be explained in the second half of this paper (Burt, 1988).
Also, the properties ascribed to “alfite” for the purposes
of this exercise do not correspond to those of any known
mineral, and use of the term “alfite” for AlF₃ (not yet
known as a mineral) does not imply approval by the In-
ternational Mineralogical Association nor the editors of
this journal.

**Acknowledgments**

These problems were created in essentially their present form in 1974
while I was J. Willard Gibbs Instructor at Yale University, and the late
Phil Orville who was a professor there is thanked for his encouragement
and contribution to Problem 9. I also thank subsequent classes at Arizona
State University for trying them and seeming to enjoy them, Jim Munoz
and Doug Rumble for helpful editorial comments, and Deborah Barron
for drafting the figure. The problem set and answers were brought to their
present form while I was Visiting Scientist at the Lunar and Planetary
Institute, Houston, Texas, where I was studying the possibility of fluori-
nating Moon rocks to release oxygen and metals. The L.P.I. is operated
by the Universities Space Research Association under Contract No. NASW-
4066 with the National Aeronautics and Space Administration. This is
Lunar and Planetary Institute Contribution no. 655.

**Reference Cited**

previous issue. American Mineralogist, 73, no. 9-10.

Manuscript received October 7, 1987
Manuscript accepted March 21, 1987